

American Chemical Science Journal 5(1): 32-40, 2015, Article no.ACSj.2015.005 ISSN: 2249-0205



SCIENCEDOMAIN international www.sciencedomain.org

# Corrosion Inhibition by Pumpkin Peels Extract in Petroleum Environment

## Rana Afif Majed Anaee<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Materials Engineering, University of Technology, Baghdad, Iraq.

## Author's contribution

The sole author designed, analyzed and interpreted and prepared the manuscript.

## Article Information

DOI: 10.9734/ACSj/2015/12594 <u>Editor(s):</u> (1) Sang Hak Lee, Professor, Department of Chemistry, Kyungpook National University Daegu, 702-701, Korea. <u>Reviewers:</u> (1) Anonymous, Henan University, China. (2) Anonymous, Jayaraj Annapackiam College, India. (3) Anonymous, Nillenium Plaza Tower, UAE. (4) Anonymous, Najran University, Najran, KSA. Complete Peer review History: <u>http://www.sciencedomain.org/review-history.php?iid=649&id=16&aid=6074</u>

Original Research Article

Received 8<sup>th</sup> July 2014 Accepted 19<sup>th</sup> August 2014 Published 12<sup>th</sup> September 2014

## ABSTRACT

The corrosion inhibition of carbon steel in petroleum environment by ethanolic extract of pumpkin peels has been studied in relation to three concentrations of the inhibitor include 3, 5 and 7mL/L at four temperatures over the range 50–80 °C using electrochemical measurements (open circuit potential measurements and galvanostatic polarization). The results were supplemented with optical microscopy and FTIR spectroscopy. All the methods employed are in reasonable agreement. Inhibition efficiencies were calculated and the results show that 5mL/L of pumpkin peels extract gave the best inhibition which ranged from 72.4 to 75.7%. Thermodynamics of adsorption (enthalpy of adsorption, the entropy of adsorption processes were calculated from experimental polarization data and the interpretation of the results reveals that this pumpkin peels extract obey Langmuir adsorption isotherm. Polarization curves indicate that green inhibitor is a mixed type inhibitor, which decreases both Tafel slopes.

Keywords: Green inhibitors; natural products; petroleum medium.

\*Corresponding author: Email: Dr.rana\_afif@yahoo.com, Dr.Rana.A.Anaee@uotechnology.edu.iq;

## **1. INTRODUCTION**

The use of inhibitors for the control of corrosion of metals and alloys which are in contact with aggressive environment is an accepted practice. Large number of organic compounds were studied and are being studied to investigate their corrosion inhibition potential. All these studies reveal that organic compounds especially those with N, S and O showed significant inhibition efficiency. But, unfortunately most of these compounds are not only expensive but also toxic to living beings. It is needless to point out the importance of cheap, safe inhibitors of corrosion. Plant extracts have become important as an environmentally acceptable, readily available and renewable source for wide range of inhibitors. They are the rich sources of ingredients which have very high inhibition efficiency. This article gives a vivid account of natural products which are used as corrosion inhibitors for various metal and alloys in aggressive media.

Many authors focused on development of naturally occurring substances as corrosion inhibitors. The available literature on corrosion inhibitors obtained from naturally occurring substances has been reviewed. The characteristic features of the investigations have been highlighted [1-15].

The aim of present work is attempt to inhibit the corrosion in petroleum medium by ethanolic extract of pumpkin peels PP at four temperatures over range 50–80°C using galvanostat. FTIR spectra and optical microscopy were supplemented the corrosion test.

#### 2. EXPERIMENTAL PART

#### 2.1 Materials and Solutions

Carbon steel was used in this work (chemical composition wt%: 0.121 C, 0.22 Si, 0.44 Mn, 0.014 P, 0.016 S, 0.041 Cr, 0.002 Mo, 0.022 Ni, 0.02 Al, 0.002 Co, 0.055 Cu and Fe remain) obtained by Spectro MAX. Cubic carbon steel (10x10x3mm) with a square surface area (1cm<sup>2</sup>) was used in all experiments. The specimen was mounted by hot mounting using formaldehyde (Bakelite) at 138°C for 8 minutes to insulate all but one side and made a hole on one side of electrical connection and then the mounted specimens has been polished with SiC emery papers in sequence of 220, 400, 600, 800, and 1200 grit to get flat and scratch-free surface and

polished to mirror finish using polish cloth and alpha alumina  $0.5\mu m$  and  $1\mu m$ , and then washed with distilled water, degreased with acetone and rinsed with distilled water.

The base electrolyte was petroleum medium obtained from Iraqi oil refinery at light naphtha unit which is works in temperature range of 50-80°C. Analysis of medium is listed in (Table 1) obtained by many techniques.

Table 1. Analysis of petroleum medium

| Analysis                 | Amount   |
|--------------------------|----------|
| Total carbon             | 48.67%   |
| Total hydrogen           | 8.73%    |
| Total nitrogen           | 0.13%    |
| Total sulfur             | 0.71%    |
| рН                       | 5.25     |
| Elect. conductivity      | 300µS/cm |
| TDS                      | 296mg/L  |
| H <sub>2</sub> O content | 40%      |
|                          |          |

Extraction of pumpkin peels PP was achieved by washing the peels by distilled water and then dried and grounded. Ethanolic extract carried out by dissolving 5gm of ground peels in 200mL ethanol and then refluxed at 45°C. The obtained extract was filtered by using Whatmann filter paper and concentrated to 100mL, which is soluble in aqueous and non aqueous solution. Three volumes of ethanolic extract were used as inhibitor includes 3, 5 and 7mL/L at four different temperatures.

#### 3. METHODS

#### **3.1 Electrochemical Measurements**

Electrochemical cell was composed of platinum counter electrode, prepared carbon steel specimen as working electrode and saturated calomel electrode (SCE) as a reference electrode according to ASTM standard cell G5-94 was used. The electrochemical behavior of carbon steel in inhibited and uninhibited solution was studied by WINKING M Lab Galvanostat by recording anodic and cathodic galvano dynamic polarization curves. Measurements were carried out by changing the electrode current automatically from -15 to +15mA at scan rate 1mA.sec<sup>-1</sup>, while open circuit potential recorded after immersion in test electrolyte for 600sec. The linear Tafel segments of anodic and cathodic curves were extrapolated to the corrosion potential to obtain corrosion parameters.

Anaee; ACSj, 5(1): 32-40, 2015; Article no. ACSj.2015.005

#### **3.2 FTIR Measurements**

The film formed on the metal surface (after immersing in the oil sour medium for 20 days till drying) was carefully removed and mixed thoroughly with KBr. The FTIR spectra were recorded in Bruker Tensor 27 Fourier Transform Infrared Spectrophotometer.

#### **3.3 Optical Microscopy**

The carbon steel specimens were corroded in various test solutions containing four different concentrations of inhibitor; the specimens were taken out and dried. The nature of the film formed on the surface of the metal specimen was analyzed by NIKON, ECLIPSE-ME600 Optical Microscope. All micrographs are taken at a magnification of 20X after immersion for 15 days.

#### 4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

#### 4.1 Galvanostatic Measurements

(Fig. 1) shows the Tafel plots for carbon steel in petroleum environment in absence and presence of pumpkin peels extract. These plots reveal the cathodic and anodic behavior, where at cathodic sites, the reduction of hydrogen can occur; while at anodic sites, the dissolution of metal takes place as follow:

$$2H^+ + 2e \rightarrow H_2$$
 At Cathode   
Fe  $\rightarrow$  Fe<sup>2+</sup> + 2e At Anode

(Table 2) gives the values of corrosion parameters as the corrosion potential  $E_{corr}$ , corrosion current density  $i_{corr}$ , and Tafel slopes ( $b_c$  and  $b_a$ ) for the corrosion of carbon steel with different concentrations of pumpkin peels PP extract. The corrosion current densities were estimated by Tafel extrapolation of the cathodic and anodic curves to the open circuit corrosion potential. From this table, it can be concluded that:

- The  $i_{corr}$  values decrease in presence of PP extract.
- The cathodic Tafel slopes were decreased. This result indicates the influence of the inhibitor on the kinetics of the hydrogen evolution reaction.
- The anodic Tafel slopes were decreased. This result indicates the influence of the inhibitor on the kinetics of the dissolution of the carbon steel.

- The values of inhibition efficiency (IE %) gave acceptable inhibition especially at 5mL/L of inhibitor concentration reaching a maximum value (75.7%) at 333K.
- The PP extract is a mixed inhibitor through the decreasing in Tafel slopes.

The inhibition efficiency IE (%) can be calculated using the equation given below [16]:

$$IE\% = \frac{(i_{corr})_a - (i_{corr})_p}{(i_{corr})_a} \times 100$$
(1)

Where  $(i_{corr})_a$  and  $(i_{corr})_p$  are the corrosion current density  $(\mu A.cm^{-2})$  in the absence and the presence of the inhibitor, respectively. The efficiencies varied with increasing temperature due to variation in cathodic and anodic sites on steel surface.

The performance of an organic inhibitor is related to the chemical structure and physicochemical properties of the compound like functional groups, electron density at the donor atom, porbital character, and the electronic structure of the molecule. The inhibition could be due to (i) Adsorption of the molecules or its ions on anodic and/or cathodic sites, (ii) increase in cathodic and/or anodic over voltage, and (iii) the formation of a protective barrier film.

#### 4.2 FTIR Spectra

(Figs. 2 and 3) show the FTIR spectra for pumpkin peels and film formed on carbon steel in petroleum medium in the presence of three concentrations of PP extract after immersion for 20 days in test medium respectively. FTIR spectrum of pumpkin peels indicates the presence of some chemical functionality groups. Wave number at 3407.46cm<sup>-1</sup> can be attribute to  $\equiv$ C-H stretch for alcohol and H-bonded. C-H aliphatic and -CHO aldehyde appear at 2923.4 and 2852.13cm<sup>-1</sup>. Disubstituted or symmetrically substituted C≡C stretch give either no absorption or weak absorption at 2362.07cm<sup>-1</sup>. C-O stretch occurs at 1109.38 cm<sup>-1</sup>, while vinyl and aromatic C=C stretch appears at 1654.88 and 1430.73cm <sup>1</sup>. These peaks indicate that pumpkin peels may be containing alcohols and phenols. The spectra of film formed on metallic surface indicate that the stretching frequency of many peaks was decreased. This suggests the coordination with Fe<sup>2+</sup> on the anodic sites of the metal surface, also resulting in the formation of Fe<sup>2+</sup>-PP-complex.



Fig. 1. Tafel plots for carbon steel in petroleum environment in the absence and presence of PP extract at four temperatures



Fig. 2. FTIR spectrum for pumpkin peels



Fig. 3. FTIR spectra for pumpkin peels and film formed on corroded surface in petroleum medium in presence of PP extract; Pumpkin peels (blue line), 3mL/L of PPE (red line), 5mL/L of PPE (pink line), and 7mL/L of PPE (green line)  $\ln K_{ads} = ln \left(\frac{1}{55.5}\right) - \frac{\Delta G_{ads}}{RT}$ 

#### 4.3 Adsorption Isotherm

The interaction between the inhibitors and steel surface can be provided by the adsorption isotherm. During corrosion inhibition of carbon steel, the nature of inhibitor on the corroding surface has been deduced in terms of adsorption behavior of inhibitors. Langmuir adsorption isotherm was used for PP extracts on carbon steel. According to this isotherm,  $\theta$  is related to the C and adsorption equilibrium constant  $K_{ads}$ , via:

$$\frac{C}{\theta} = \frac{1}{K_{ads}} + C$$
, where  $\theta = 1 - \frac{(i_{corr})_p}{(i_{corr})_a}$  (2)

The plot of  $C/\theta$  versus C gave a straight line (Fig. 4) with a slope of about unity confirming that the adsorption of PP extracts on carbon steel surface obeys the Langmuir adsorption isotherm and R<sup>2</sup> values were in the range  $0.991 \ge R^2 \ge 0.919$  as listed in (Table 3).  $K_{ads}$  is connected to the standard Gibb's free energy of adsorption  $\Delta G_{ads}$ , according to the equation given below:

$$K_{ads} = \frac{1}{55.5} exp\left(\frac{-\Delta G_{ads}}{RT}\right)$$
(3)

Where R is the universal gas constant, T is the absolute temperature and 55.5 is the concentration of water in solution (mol. $L^{-1}$ ). This isotherm assumes that the solid surface contains a fixed number of adsorption sites and each site holds one adsorbed species. The values of Kads are relatively small indicating that the interaction between the adsorbed extract molecules and steel surface is physically adsorbed. This is also supported by lower negative ( $\Delta G^{\circ}_{ads}$ ) values for PP extract. Generally, values of ( $\Delta G^{\circ}_{ads}$ ) up to – 20 kJ/mol are consistent with electrostatic interactions between the charged molecules and the charged metal surface, which indicates physical adsorption [17]. The negative values of

(4)

 $\Delta G_{ads}$  suggest that the adsorption of inhibitor onto steel surface is a spontaneous process [18]. More negative values of  $\Delta G_{ads}$  also indicate the strong interaction of the inhibitor molecules onto the metal surface [19]. The values of  $\Delta H_{ads}$  and  $\Delta S_{ads}$  can be calculated by using following equation:

$$\Delta G_{ads} = \Delta H_{ads} - T \Delta S_{ads} \tag{5}$$

Using Eq. (5), the plot of  $\Delta G_{ads}$  versus T gives a straight line with a slope of -  $\Delta S_{ads}$  and intercept of  $\Delta H_{ads}$ . The values obtained are correlated with

and

those obtained from Eq. (5). The negative values of  $\Delta H_{ads}$  indicate that the adsorption process is an exothermic phenomenon [20]. The exothermic process is attributed to either physical or chemical adsorption or mixture of [21] whereas endothermic process corresponds to chemisorption [21-23]. The negative values of  $\Delta S_{ads}$  in both the acids implies that the activated complex in the rate determining step denotes an association rather than a dissociation step, meaning that a reduction in disordering takes place on going from reactants to the activated complex.

The inhibitive characteristics of such compounds derive from the adsorption ability of their molecules, with the polar group acting as the reaction center for the adsorption process. The resulting adsorbed film acts as a barrier that separates the metal from the corrodent, and efficiency of inhibition depends on the mechanical, structural, and chemical characteristics of the adsorption layers formed under particular conditions.

## 4.4 Optical Microscopy

Optical microscope test shows the surface of carbon steel before and after adding PP extract with three concentrations. (Fig. 5) shows that corrosion has added some undesirable features to the material samples. These images show a noticeable reduction in corrosion sites and corrosion products on the corroded surface after adding the inhibitors as compared with the case of corrosion in the petroleum medium without inhibitor especially in the presence of the best concentration of inhibitor 5mL/L.

Table 2. Corrosion parameters for polarization of carbon steel in petroleum medium in the absence and presence of alcoholic extract of pumpkin peel at four temperatures

| Conc. of extracted | Temp. K | E <sub>corr</sub> mV | i <sub>corr</sub><br>µA.cm⁻² | -b <sub>c</sub><br>mV.dec⁻¹ | +b <sub>a</sub><br>mV.dec <sup>-1</sup> | P%       |
|--------------------|---------|----------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|---|----------|
| 0                  | 323     | -759.8               | 497.68                       | 1095.3                      | 1087.7                                  | -        |
|                    | 333     | -322.0               | 682.72                       | 1632.2                      | 1647.9                                  | -        |
|                    | 343     | -496.2               | 694.09                       | 2321.5                      | 1957.9                                  | -        |
|                    | 353     | -665.1               | 719.78                       | 1606.6                      | 1597.8                                  | -        |
| 3mL/L              | 323     | -599.8               | 166.51                       | 512.0                       | 527.1                                   | 66.54276 |
|                    | 333     | -519.5               | 166.75                       | 442.9                       | 425.0                                   | 75.57564 |
|                    | 343     | -525.4               | 214.32                       | 416.9                       | 433.2                                   | 69.12216 |
|                    | 353     | -438.8               | 271.24                       | 495.7                       | 465.7                                   | 62.31626 |
| 5mL/L              | 323     | -506.9               | 137.15                       | 510.9                       | 475.2                                   | 72.44213 |
|                    | 333     | -506.8               | 165.82                       | 590.1                       | 573.9                                   | 75.71186 |
|                    | 343     | -524.7               | 176.10                       | 481.0                       | 455.8                                   | 74.62865 |
|                    | 353     | -445.7               | 177.69                       | 467.6                       | 459.0                                   | 75.31329 |
| 7mL/L              | 323     | -378.4               | 157.08                       | 468.6                       | 403.4                                   | 68.43755 |
|                    | 333     | -407.0               | 272.16                       | 627.8                       | 607.7                                   | 60.13593 |
|                    | 343     | -530.3               | 297.49                       | 623.7                       | 599.9                                   | 57.13956 |
|                    | 353     | -487.3               | 311.08                       | 632.9                       | 547.2                                   | 56.78124 |

#### Table 3. Thermodynamic parameters for adsorption of PP extract on carbon steel in petroleum medium at different temperature

| Temp. K | R <sup>2</sup> | K <sub>ads</sub><br>L.mL <sup>-1</sup> | ∆G <sub>ads</sub><br>kJ.mol <sup>-1</sup> | ∆H <sub>ads</sub><br>kJ.mol <sup>-1</sup> | ∆S <sub>ads</sub><br>J.mol <sup>-1</sup> K <sup>-1</sup> | ∆G <sub>ads</sub> (eq.4)<br>kJ.mol <sup>⁻1</sup> |
|---------|----------------|--|---|---|--|--|
| 323     | 0.991          | 3.597                                  | -13.9086                                  | -26.68                                    | -40.06   | -13.741  |
| 333     | 0.968          | 2.320                                  | -13.1521                                  |   |  | -13.340  |
| 343     | 0.948          | 1.812                                  | -12.8570                                  |   |  | -12.939  |
| 353     | 0.919          | 1.490                                  | -12.6716                                  |   |  | -12.539  |



Fig. 4. Langmuir adsorption isotherm of PP extracts on steel in petroleum medium at various temperatures



In petroleum medium

Petroleum+3mL/L PP



Petroleum+5mL/L PP

Petroleum+7mL/L PP

Fig. 5. Optical microscopies for corroded surface in petroleum medium in absence and presence PP extract

The optical microscopy of surface of corroded specimen in petroleum medium without inhibitor shows flakes with dark color which refers to corrosion products due to expose to aggressive corrosion results from direct exposure to petroleum medium, but in the presence of the inhibitors there is a much smaller damage on the surface and rather clear color. This is attributed to the formation of a good protective film on the carbon steel surface prevents direct contact between metal and petroleum medium.

## **5. CONCLUSION**

Ethanolic extract of pumpkin peels has been studied as corrosion inhibitor for carbon steel in petroleum medium with three concentrations 3, 5 and 7mL/L at four temperatures over the range 50-80°C using electrochemical measurements and FTIR spectra supplemented with optical microscopy. Pumpkin peels extract gave the best inhibition which ranged from 72.4 to 75.7%. Thermodynamic functions of adsorption processes were calculated from experimental polarization data and the interpretation of the results reveals that this pumpkin peels extract obey Langmuir adsorption isotherm. Polarization curves indicate that green inhibitor is a mixed type inhibitor.

## **COMPETING INTERESTS**

Author has declared that no competing interests exist.

## REFERENCES

- 1. Shaheen Taj, Aisha Siddekha, Sankara Papavinasam, and R. Winstone Revie. Some natural products as green corrosion inhibitors. NACE International, ID 07630; 2007.
- Pandian Bothi Raja, Mathur Gopalakrishnan Sethuraman. Natural products as corrosion inhibitor for metals in corrosive media - A review. Materials Letters. 2008;62(1):113–116.
- Buchweishaija J, Mhinzi GS. Natural products as a source of environmentally friendly corrosion inhibitors: The case of gum exudates from *Acacia seyal* var. seyal. Portugaliae Electrochimica Acta 26. 2008;257-265.
- Boris M. Miksic, Alla Y. Furman, Margarita A. Kharshan. Effectiveness of the corrosion inhibitors for the petroleum

industry under various flow conditions. Corrosion. 2009;09573.

- Buchweishaija J. Plants as a source of green corrosion inhibitors: The case of gum exudates from acacia species. Tanz J Sci. 2009;35.
- Ambrish Singh, Singh VK, Quraishi MA. Effect of fruit extracts of some environmentally benign green corrosion inhibitors on corrosion of mild steel in hydrochloric acid solution. J Mater Environ Sci. 2010;1(3):162-174.
- 7. Loto CA, Loto RT, Popoola API. Corrosion and plants extracts inhibition of mild steel in HCI. International Journal of the Physical Sciences. 2011;6(15):3616-3623.
- Abu-Dalo MA, Othman AA, Al-Rawashdeh NAF. Exudate gum from acacia trees as green corrosion inhibitor for mild steel in acidic Media. Int J Electrochem Sci. 2012;7:9303–9324.
- 9. Shivakumar SS, Mohana KN. *Centella asiatica* extracts as green corrosion inhibitor for mild steel in 0.5 M sulphuric acid medium. Advances in Applied Science Research. 2012;3(5):3097-3106.
- Sangeetha M, Rajendran S, Sathiyabama J, Prabhakar P. Asafoetida extract (ASF) as green corrosion inhibitor for mild steel in Sea Water. Int Res J Environment Sci. 2012;1(5):14-21.
- Benali O, Benmehdi H, Hasnaoui O, Selles C, Salghi R. Green corrosion inhibitor: inhibitive action of tannin extract of *Chamaerops humilis* plant for the corrosion of mild steel in 0.5M H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>. J Mater Environ Sci. 2013;4(1):127-138.
- 12. Fouda AS, El-desoky AM, Hala M. Hassan. Quinazoline derivatives as green corrosion inhibitors for carbon steel in hydrochloric acid solutions. Int J Electrochem Sci. 2013;8:5866–5885.
- Rajam K, Rajendran S, Saranya R. Allium sativum (Garlic) extract as nontoxic corrosion inhibitor. Journal of Chemistry. 2013;2013:4. Article ID 743807.
- Iloamaeke IM, Onuegbu TU, Umeobika UC, Umedum NL. Green approach to corrosion inhibition of mild steel using *Emilia sonchifolia* and *Vitex doniana* in 2.5M HCI medium. International Journal of Science and Modern Engineering (IJISME). 2013;1(3). ISSN: 2319-6386.
- 15. Khaled KF, Ebenso E. Cerium salt as green corrosion inhibitor for steel in acid medium. Research on Chemical Intermediates; 2013.

Anaee; ACSj, 5(1): 32-40, 2015; Article no. ACSj.2015.005

- 16. Shivakumar SS, Mohana KN. Studies on the inhibitive performance of *Cinnamomum zeylanicum* extracts on the corrosion of mild steel in hydrochloric acid and sulphuric acid media. J Mater Environ Sci. 2013;4(3):448-459.
- Migahed MA. Electrochemical investigation of the corrosion behaviour of mild steel in 2 M HCl solution in presence of 1-dodecyl-4-methoxy pyridinium bromide. Mater Chem and Phys. 2005;93(1):48-53.
- Libin Tang, Xueming Li, Guannan Mu, Lin Li, Guangheng Liu. Synergistic effect between 4-(2-pyridylazo) resorcin and chloride ion on the corrosion of cold rolled steel in 1.0 M phosphoric acid. Appl Surf Sci. 2006;253:2367-2372.
- Ameer MA, Fekry AM, Othman A. Electrochemical investigation of green inhibitor adsorption on low-carbon steel in produced water. Int J Electrochem Sci. 2014;9:1964–1985.

- Bentiss F, Lebrini M, Lagrenée M. Thermodynamic characterization of metal dissolution and inhibitor adsorption processes in mild steel/2,5-bis(n-thienyl)-1,3,4-thiadiazoles/hydrochloric acid system. Corros Sci. 2005;47:2915.
- Durnie W, Marco RD, Jefferson A, Kinsella B. Development of structure-activity relationship for oil field corrosion inhibitors. J Electrochem Soc. 1999;(146):1751-1756.
- 22. Ali SA, El-Shareef AM, Al-Ghamdi RF, Saeed MT. The isoxazolidines: The effects of steric factor and hydrophobic chain length on the corrosion inhibition of mild steel in acidic medium. Corros Sci. 2005;47:2659.
- 23. Arshadi MR, Lashgari M, Parsafar GA. Cluster approach to corrosion inhibition problems: Interaction studies. Mater Chem and Phys. 2004;86:311.

© 2015 Anaee; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Peer-review history: The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here: http://www.sciencedomain.org/review-history.php?iid=649&id=16&aid=6074